

SENATE BILL 1058

F1

4lr2620
CF HB 1181

By: **Senators Kramer, Brooks, Feldman, Gile, Hettleman, Jackson, Lam, Lewis Young, Salling, Smith, Waldstreicher, West, ~~and Zucker~~ Zucker, and Kagan**

Introduced and read first time: February 2, 2024

Assigned to: Education, Energy, and the Environment

Committee Report: Favorable with amendments

Senate action: Adopted

Read second time: February 26, 2024

CHAPTER _____

1 AN ACT concerning

2 **Education – Curriculum Standards – Antihate and Holocaust Education**
3 **(Educate to Stop the Hate Act)**

4 FOR the purpose of requiring ~~the State Board of Education to adopt certain~~ county boards
5 of education to establish curriculum guides and courses of study that are aligned
6 with certain content standards developed by the State Department of Education, and
7 requiring the State Board of Education to withhold certain funds from county boards
8 that fail to do so; establishing certain requirements for the Department’s process for
9 developing, reviewing, and adopting certain content standards, curriculum
10 standards, and curriculum resources; requiring the State Board to review, revise,
11 and adopt certain content standards, curriculum standards, and curriculum
12 resources on or before a certain date; ~~requiring the State Department of Education~~
13 and to revise and enhance certain history and social studies frameworks to ~~include~~
14 ~~certain instruction~~ incorporate certain standards; requiring all ~~public schools~~ county
15 ~~boards and certain nonpublic schools to include the revised and enhanced instruction~~
16 ~~in school curricula~~ establish curriculum resources aligned with certain content
17 standards and curriculum standards beginning in a certain school year; ~~requiring~~
18 ~~county boards of education to dedicate a portion of Title II funds for professional~~
19 ~~development related to teaching the requirements of this Act;~~ encouraging certain
20 nonpublic schools in the State to include in the school’s curriculum at least a unit of
21 instruction on certain topics ~~consistent with the purposes of this Act;~~ and generally
22 relating to antihate and Holocaust education and curriculum standards.

EXPLANATION: CAPITALS INDICATE MATTER ADDED TO EXISTING LAW.

[Brackets] indicate matter deleted from existing law.

Underlining indicates amendments to bill.

~~Strike out~~ indicates matter stricken from the bill by amendment or deleted from the law by amendment.



1 BY ~~adding to~~ repealing and reenacting, with amendments,

2 Article – Education

3 Section ~~7-135~~ 4-111(a) and 7-202.1

4 Annotated Code of Maryland

5 (2022 Replacement Volume and 2023 Supplement)

6 Preamble

7 WHEREAS, Hate, bigotry, and prejudice undermine the very fabric of our society,
8 jeopardizing the fundamental principles of equity, dignity, and respect for all individuals;
9 and

10 WHEREAS, Hateful sentiment is reaching unprecedented levels in contemporary
11 society and is reaching a critical mass that threatens both the physical and psychological
12 well-being of our residents; and

13 WHEREAS, Social media and technology are being used to disseminate false and
14 inaccurate information leading to the rising tide of hate crimes, discrimination, and
15 intolerance that threatens the harmonious coexistence of diverse communities; and

16 WHEREAS, Understanding American and world history can be critical in addressing
17 the dramatic rise in hate rhetoric and hate-related actions and crimes; and

18 WHEREAS, Education will help students understand the roots and ramifications of
19 prejudice, racism, and stereotyping, develop an awareness of the value of pluralism and
20 diversity, explore the dangers of remaining silent, apathetic, and indifferent to the
21 oppression of others, and learn how the abuse of power can lead to the implementation of
22 destructive policies resulting in government-sponsored policies ranging from social
23 engineering to genocide; and

24 WHEREAS, It is a policy of the General Assembly to avoid legislating the instruction
25 of the public school system, but the unprecedented expressions of hate, bigotry, and
26 prejudice have reached a critical and alarming mass requiring that the General Assembly
27 take unprecedented policy action to best achieve outcomes for the people of the State; now,
28 therefore,

29 SECTION 1. BE IT ENACTED BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF MARYLAND,
30 That the Laws of Maryland read as follows:

31 **Article – Education**

32 4-111.

33 (a) Subject to the applicable provisions of this article and the bylaws, basic
34 policies, and guidelines established by the State Board, each county board, on the written
35 recommendation of the county superintendent, shall:

1 (1) Establish curriculum guides and courses of study ALIGNED WITH THE
2 CONTENT STANDARDS DEVELOPED UNDER § 7-202.1 OF THIS ARTICLE for the schools
3 under its jurisdiction, including appropriate programs of instruction or training for
4 mentally or physically handicapped children; and

5 (2) Supply printed copies of these materials to any teacher or interested
6 [citizen] INDIVIDUAL.

7 7-202.1.

8 (a) **(1) IN THIS SECTION THE FOLLOWING WORDS HAVE THE MEANINGS**
9 **INDICATED.**

10 **(2) “CONTENT STANDARDS” MEANS THE STATEMENTS FOR THE**
11 **PROGRAM OF INSTRUCTION THAT DESCRIBE THE KNOWLEDGE AND SKILLS**
12 **STUDENTS ARE EXPECTED TO ATTAIN FOR EACH CONTENT AREA AND GRADE LEVEL.**

13 **(3) “CURRICULUM RESOURCES” MEANS GUIDANCE DOCUMENTS AND**
14 **FRAMEWORKS USED BY A COUNTY BOARD TO DEVELOP CURRICULA TO IMPLEMENT**
15 **CONTENT STANDARDS.**

16 **(4) “CURRICULUM STANDARDS” MEANS THE STATEMENTS THAT**
17 **OUTLINE APPROACHES TO LEARNING FOR EACH CONTENT AREA ACROSS GRADE**
18 **LEVELS.**

19 **(B) (1) The Department shall, in consultation with experienced and highly**
20 **effective teachers, including teachers on the career ladder under Title 6, Subtitle 10 of this**
21 **article, develop CONTENT STANDARDS, curriculum standards, and curriculum resources**
22 **for each subject at each grade level, that build on one another in logical sequence, in core**
23 **subjects that may be used by local school systems and public school teachers.**

24 **(2) THE CONTENT STANDARDS AND CURRICULUM STANDARDS**
25 **DEVELOPED UNDER PARAGRAPH (1) OF THIS SUBSECTION SHALL:**

26 **(I) INCLUDE EVIDENCE-BASED PRACTICES AND THE SCIENCE**
27 **OF INSTRUCTION TO ENSURE THAT ALL STUDENTS MEET THEIR FULL POTENTIAL;**

28 **(II) CONSIDER THE IMPACT ON ALL STUDENTS WITH A**
29 **STRATEGIC FOCUS ON MARGINALIZED STUDENT GROUPS; AND**

30 **(III) REFLECT THE HISTORY OF MARGINALIZED GROUPS WITH**
31 **PARTICULAR CONSIDERATION OF THE ASSOCIATED HISTORICAL CONTEXT AND**
32 **ROOT CAUSES.**

1 (3) THE DEPARTMENT SHALL REVIEW THE CONTENT STANDARDS
 2 AND CURRICULUM STANDARDS AT LEAST EVERY 8 YEARS.

3 (4) THE DEPARTMENT SHALL ESTABLISH A PROCESS FOR
 4 MAINTAINING STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT DURING THE PROCESSES OF
 5 DEVELOPING AND REVIEWING CONTENT STANDARDS AND CURRICULUM
 6 STANDARDS.

7 (5) IF A COUNTY BOARD FAILS TO ESTABLISH CURRICULUM
 8 RESOURCES AND COURSES OF STUDY ALIGNED WITH THE CONTENT STANDARDS AND
 9 CURRICULUM STANDARDS DEVELOPED UNDER PARAGRAPH (1) OF THIS
 10 SUBSECTION, THE STATE SUPERINTENDENT MAY WITHHOLD STATE FUNDS IN
 11 ACCORDANCE WITH §§ 2-303 AND 5-205 OF THIS ARTICLE.

12 [(b)] (C) (1) The purpose of the curriculum standards and curriculum
 13 resources developed under this section is to provide county boards with technical assistance
 14 to inform high-quality instruction that will ultimately result in students meeting the
 15 college and career readiness standards in the manner described under § 7-205.1 of this
 16 subtitle.

17 (2) The curriculum resources developed under this section shall include,
 18 for each core subject at each grade level:

19 (i) Course syllabi;

20 (ii) Sample lessons for teachers to use as models;

21 (iii) Examples of student work that meet standards for proficiency;

22 (iv) Explanations of why student work examples meet proficiency
 23 standards so that teachers know what student knowledge is required; and

24 (v) Curriculum units aligned with the course syllabi.

25 (3) In developing the curriculum resources under this subsection, the
 26 Department:

27 (i) May use as a model a course or unit developed by a teacher in or
 28 out of the State; but

29 (ii) Shall review each model course and unit for quality, using
 30 accepted benchmarks such as approval by EdReports or Tier 1 and Tier 2 evidence-based
 31 standards established by the federal Every Student Succeeds Act.

32 (4) The Department shall compile curriculum units in such a manner that:

1 (i) Complete courses are formed; and

2 (ii) When taken by a student in sequence, the student can achieve
 3 the college and career readiness standard adopted under § 7–205.1 of this subtitle by the
 4 end of grade 10.

5 ~~[(c)]~~ (D) The Department shall submit curriculum resources and curriculum
 6 standards developed under this section to the State Board for adoption.

7 ~~[(d)]~~ (E) The State Board shall establish a system of assessments to ensure that
 8 students are acquiring the knowledge contained in the curriculum standards in English,
 9 Mathematics, Science, and History or Social Studies.

10 ~~[(e)]~~ (F) (1) Using the assessments established under subsection ~~[(d)]~~ (E) of
 11 this section, the Department shall identify low-performing schools.

12 (2) An Expert Review Team established under § 5–411 of this article, under
 13 the supervision of the Department, shall visit schools identified under paragraph (1) of this
 14 subsection according to the criteria established under § 5–411 of this article.

15 (3) If the Department, based on a recommendation of an Expert Review
 16 Team, determines that a school’s low performance on assessments is, largely, due to
 17 curricular problems, the school shall adopt the curriculum resources developed under this
 18 section.

19 (4) Except as provided in paragraph (3) of this subsection, this section does
 20 not require a public school or county board to adopt the Department’s curriculum standards
 21 and curriculum resources and may not be construed to restrict a county board’s authority
 22 to adopt curricula under § 4–111 of this article.

23 ~~7–135.~~

24 ~~(A) THIS SECTION APPLIES TO:~~

25 ~~(1) ALL PUBLIC ELEMENTARY SCHOOLS, MIDDLE SCHOOLS, AND~~
 26 ~~HIGH SCHOOLS; AND~~

27 ~~(2) ALL NONPUBLIC ELEMENTARY SCHOOLS, MIDDLE SCHOOLS, AND~~
 28 ~~HIGH SCHOOLS THAT PARTICIPATE IN STATE FUNDED EDUCATION PROGRAMS.~~

29 ~~(B) (1) ON OR BEFORE JANUARY 1, 2025, THE STATE BOARD SHALL~~
 30 ~~ADOPT CURRICULUM STANDARDS AND CURRICULUM RESOURCES FOR~~
 31 ~~INSTRUCTIONAL CONTENT ON:~~

1 ~~(I) COMPREHENSIVE ANTHIATE EDUCATION UTILIZING~~
2 ~~HISTORICAL CONTEXTS THAT HAVE LED TO CONTEMPORARY RACISM AND~~
3 ~~PREJUDICE; AND~~

4 ~~(II) THE HOLOCAUST.~~

5 ~~(2) THE CURRICULUM STANDARDS AND CURRICULUM RESOURCES~~
6 ~~ADOPTED UNDER PARAGRAPH (1) OF THIS SUBSECTION SHALL BE~~
7 ~~AGE APPROPRIATE, INTERDISCIPLINARY, AND CONSISTENT WITH OTHER~~
8 ~~REQUIRED GRADE LEVEL INSTRUCTION.~~

9 ~~(C) (1) THE DEPARTMENT SHALL:~~

10 ~~(i) REVISE AND ENHANCE THE HIGH SCHOOL HISTORY~~
11 ~~FRAMEWORK TO INCLUDE INSTRUCTION ON THE HISTORY AND CONTRIBUTIONS OF~~
12 ~~HISTORICALLY DISADVANTAGED RACIAL AND ETHNIC GROUPS, INCLUDING:~~

13 ~~1. AFRICAN AMERICANS;~~

14 ~~2. NATIVE AMERICANS;~~

15 ~~3. ASIAN AMERICANS AND PACIFIC ISLANDERS;~~

16 ~~4. HISPANIC AMERICANS;~~

17 ~~5. JEWISH AMERICANS;~~

18 ~~6. ARAB AMERICANS; AND~~

19 ~~7. OTHER HISTORICALLY DISADVANTAGED RACIAL AND~~
20 ~~ETHNIC GROUPS;~~

21 ~~(ii) REVISE AND ENHANCE THE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL SOCIAL~~
22 ~~STUDIES FRAMEWORK FOR GRADES 4 AND 5 TO INCORPORATE INSTRUCTION~~
23 ~~ADDRESSING THE HOLOCAUST WITHIN THE GRADE 5 UNIT;~~

24 ~~(iii) REVISE AND ENHANCE THE MIDDLE SCHOOL SOCIAL~~
25 ~~STUDIES FRAMEWORK FOR GRADES 6 AND 7 TO INCORPORATE A STUDY OF THE~~
26 ~~ROOTS OF ANTISEMITISM THAT LED TO THE HOLOCAUST TO HELP STUDENTS~~
27 ~~CONTEXTUALIZE THE STUDY OF THE HOLOCAUST IN HIGH SCHOOL; AND~~

28 ~~(iv) REVISE AND ENHANCE THE HIGH SCHOOL HISTORY~~
29 ~~FRAMEWORK TO STRENGTHEN THE REQUIRED HOLOCAUST INSTRUCTION IN:~~

1 1. ~~THE UNITED STATES HISTORY CURRICULUM, TO~~
2 ~~REQUIRE STUDENTS TO STUDY THE AMERICAN RESPONSE TO THE HOLOCAUST BY~~
3 ~~FIRST UNDERSTANDING THE ORIGINS OF THE HOLOCAUST; AND~~

4 2. ~~THE MODERN WORLD HISTORY CURRICULUM, TO~~
5 ~~REQUIRE STUDENTS TO EVALUATE THE CAUSE, COURSE, AND CONSEQUENCES OF~~
6 ~~THE HOLOCAUST.~~

7 (2) ~~THE REVISED AND ENHANCED HISTORY AND SOCIAL STUDIES~~
8 ~~FRAMEWORKS DEVELOPED UNDER PARAGRAPH (1) OF THIS SUBSECTION MAY NOT~~
9 ~~EXPAND THE TOTAL AMOUNT OF INSTRUCTION REQUIRED FOR ANY GIVEN COURSE.~~

10 (D) ~~BEGINNING IN THE 2025-2026 SCHOOL YEAR, ALL PUBLIC SCHOOLS~~
11 ~~AND ALL NONPUBLIC SCHOOLS THAT PARTICIPATE IN STATE FUNDED EDUCATION~~
12 ~~PROGRAMS SHALL INCLUDE THE REVISED AND ENHANCED INSTRUCTIONAL~~
13 ~~CONTENT DEVELOPED UNDER SUBSECTION (C) OF THIS SECTION IN SCHOOL~~
14 ~~CURRICULA.~~

15 (E) (1) ~~EACH COUNTY BOARD SHALL DEDICATE A PORTION OF TITLE II~~
16 ~~FUNDS FOR SUBSTANTIVE PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT ON TRAINING ON~~
17 ~~TEACHING THE REQUIREMENTS OF THIS SECTION.~~

18 (2) ~~TEACHERS PARTICIPATING IN PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT ON~~
19 ~~TRAINING ON TEACHING THE REQUIREMENTS OF THIS SECTION:~~

20 (I) ~~SHALL BE PAID OR REIMBURSED AT LOCALLY NEGOTIATED~~
21 ~~RATES; AND~~

22 (II) ~~MAY BE ELIGIBLE FOR CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL~~
23 ~~DEVELOPMENT CREDITS.~~

24 (F) ~~IT IS THE INTENT OF THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY THAT:~~

25 (1) ~~THE CURRICULUM STANDARDS ADOPTED BY THE STATE BOARD~~
26 ~~UNDER SUBSECTION (B) OF THIS SECTION BE THE MINIMUM REQUIRED FOR~~
27 ~~TEACHING THESE ESSENTIAL TOPICS TO STUDENTS IN PUBLIC SCHOOLS ACROSS~~
28 ~~THE STATE; AND~~

29 (2) ~~ALL SCHOOLS IN THE STATE ARE ENCOURAGED TO INCORPORATE~~
30 ~~ANTHATE EDUCATION INTO THE FULL RANGE OF SUBJECTS TAUGHT IN SCHOOLS~~
31 ~~TO PROVIDE THE MOST BENEFIT TO STUDENTS.~~

32 (G) ~~EACH NONPUBLIC ELEMENTARY, MIDDLE, AND HIGH SCHOOL IN THE~~
33 ~~STATE THAT DOES NOT PARTICIPATE IN STATE FUNDED EDUCATION PROGRAMS IS~~

~~ENCOURAGED TO INCLUDE IN THE SCHOOL'S CURRICULUM AT LEAST A UNIT OF INSTRUCTION ON THE TOPICS DESCRIBED IN SUBSECTION (B) OF THIS SECTION USING OR BASED ON THE CURRICULUM STANDARDS ADOPTED BY THE STATE BOARD.~~

SECTION 2. AND BE IT FURTHER ENACTED, That:

(a) On or before January 1, 2025, the State Board of Education shall:

(1) (i) review, revise, and adopt the curriculum standards for the State comprehensive instructional program in social studies to include comprehensive antihate education using historical contexts that have led to racism and prejudice in society; and

(ii) develop and adopt interdisciplinary curriculum resources to promote antihate education using historical contexts that have led to racism and prejudice in society;

(2) (i) develop or revise and adopt content standards for high school history to include instruction on:

1. the history and contributions of historically disadvantaged groups;

2. the topics of genocide, torture, war crimes, crimes against humanity, and the treatment of ethnic and religious minorities; and

3. the transatlantic slave trade;

(ii) revise and enhance the high school history frameworks to incorporate the content standards adopted in accordance with item (i) of this item; and

(iii) review, revise, and adopt curriculum standards to incorporate the history of genocide, including the Holocaust; and

(3) (i) 1. adopt content standards for elementary school social studies for grades 4 and 5 to include instruction on the Holocaust within the grade 5 unit;

2. adopt content standards for middle school social studies to include a study of the roots of antisemitism that led to the Holocaust so that students may contextualize the study of the Holocaust in high school; and

3. adopt content standards for high school Modern World History and United States History to include instruction on the Holocaust by first understanding the origins of the Holocaust and to evaluate the cause, course, and consequences of the Holocaust; and

1 (ii) review and enhance the elementary school and middle school
2 frameworks and the high school history frameworks to incorporate the content standards
3 regarding the Holocaust adopted in accordance with item (i) of this item.

4 (b) (1) It is the intent of the General Assembly that, beginning in the
5 2025–2026 school year, all county boards of education in the State and all nonpublic schools
6 in the State that hold a Certificate of Approval issued by the State Board of Education
7 under § 2–206 of the Education Article shall establish curriculum resources for the schools
8 under their jurisdiction aligned with the content standards and curriculum standards
9 established by the State Board under subsection (a) of this section.

10 (2) A nonpublic school that is operated by a registered bona fide church
11 organization or that has not been approved by the State Board under § 2–206 of the
12 Education Article, is encouraged to include in the school’s social studies and history
13 curriculum at least a unit of instruction on the topics described in subsection (a) of this
14 section using or based on the content standards and curriculum standards adopted by the
15 State Board under subsection (a) of this section.

16 SECTION ~~2~~ 3. AND BE IT FURTHER ENACTED, That this Act shall take effect
17 July 1, 2024.

Approved:

Governor.

President of the Senate.

Speaker of the House of Delegates.