## **SENATE BILL 653**

M3, M1 4lr1885 CF HB 1101

By: Senator Augustine Senators Augustine, Elfreth, Smith, and M. Washington

Introduced and read first time: January 29, 2024 Assigned to: Education, Energy, and the Environment

Committee Report: Favorable with amendments

Senate action: Adopted

Read second time: March 16, 2024

CHAPTER

1 AN ACT concerning

2

3

## Standing – Environmental and Natural Resources Protection Proceedings (Clean Water Justice Act of 2024)

4 FOR the purpose of providing certain persons and associations standing in certain 5 environmental and natural resources protection proceedings, including proceedings 6 arising under provisions of law relating to water quality and water resources 7 protection, subject to certain conditions; authorizing certain persons that meet 8 certain standing requirements to bring certain civil actions under certain 9 circumstances; requiring a plaintiff, under certain circumstances, to give certain 10 notice and provide certain documentation to the Department of the Environment and 11 the Attorney General in a certain manner and to file a certain affidavit; authorizing 12 a court to grant certain relief, award certain costs of litigation, and impose certain 13 civil penalties in certain civil actions under certain circumstances; authorizing 14 certain persons that meet certain standing requirements to intervene in certain 15 proceedings under certain circumstances; and generally relating to standing in 16 certain environmental and natural resources protection proceedings.

17 BY adding to

19

20

18 Article – Environment

Section 1–901 through  $\frac{1-905}{1-904}$  to be under the new subtitle "Subtitle 9. Clean

Water Justice Act"

21 Annotated Code of Maryland

22 (2013 Replacement Volume and 2023 Supplement)

23 BY repealing

## EXPLANATION: CAPITALS INDICATE MATTER ADDED TO EXISTING LAW.

[Brackets] indicate matter deleted from existing law.

<u>Underlining</u> indicates amendments to bill.

Strike out indicates matter stricken from the bill by amendment or deleted from the law by amendment.



1 2 3 4	Article – Environment Section 9–344.1 Annotated Code of Maryland (2014 Replacement Volume and 2023 Supplement)				
5 6	SECTION 1. BE IT ENACTED BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF MARYLAND, That the Laws of Maryland read as follows:				
7	Article – Environment				
8	SUBTITLE 9. CLEAN WATER JUSTICE ACT.				
9	1–901.				
10 11	(A) IN THIS SUBTITLE THE FOLLOWING WORDS HAVE THE MEANINGS INDICATED.				
12 13 14	(B) "ASSOCIATION" MEANS AN ASSOCIATION, A CORPORATION, OR ANY OTHER ORGANIZATION THAT CONSISTS OF TWO OR MORE MEMBERS JOINED BY MUTUAL CONSENT FOR A COMMON PURPOSE.				
15 16 17	(c) (b) "Costs of litigation" includes reasonable attorney's fees, court costs, <u>and</u> expert witness fees <del>, and documented costs incurred in investigating alleged violations</del> .				
18 19	(D) (1) "INJURY IN FACT" MEANS AN INVASION OF A LEGALLY PROTECTED INTEREST THAT IS:				
20	(I) CONCRETE AND PARTICULARIZED;				
21	(II) ACTUAL OR IMMINENT; AND				
22	(III) NOT CONJECTURAL OR HYPOTHETICAL.				
23	(2) "INJURY IN FACT" INCLUDES:				
24	(I) A PROPERTY RIGHT OR PERSONAL INTEREST THAT IS				
2 <del>5</del>	DISTINCT FROM, OR SPECIFICALLY AFFECTED IN A WAY THAT IS DISTINCT FROM, A				
26	PROPERTY RIGHT OR PERSONAL INTEREST OF THE GENERAL PUBLIC; AND				
27	(II) A NEGATIVE IMPACT, OR THE THREAT OF A NEGATIVE				
28	IMPACT, TO A PERSON'S HEALTH OR TO THE USE AND ENJOYMENT OF A NATURAL				
29	RESOURCE OR ENVIRONMENT, INCLUDING A NEGATIVE IMPACT TO AESTHETIC,				
30	RECREATIONAL, CONSERVATIONAL, AND ECONOMIC INTERESTS THAT MAY BE				
31	SHARED AMONG COMMUNITY MEMBERS.				

1	<u>(C)</u>	"EPHEMERAL STREAM" MEANS A BODY OF WATER WITH:
2		(1) A STREAM BED LOCATED ABOVE THE WATER TABLE YEAR-ROUND;
3 4	AND	(2) A STREAM FLOW PRIMARILY SOURCED FROM RAINFALL RUNOFF;
5 6	AFTER, PR	(3) FLOWING WATER ONLY DURING, AND FOR A SHORT DURATION ECIPITATION EVENTS IN A TYPICAL YEAR.
7	<u>(D)</u>	"INTERMITTENT STREAM" MEANS A BODY OF WATER WITH:
8	GROUNDWA	(1) FLOWING WATER DURING CERTAIN TIMES OF THE YEAR, WHEN ATER PROVIDES WATER FOR STREAM FLOW; AND
0		(2) A STREAM FLOW SUPPLEMENTED BY RUNOFF FROM RAINFALL.
11 12 13	ANY PAF	"PERSON" MEANS AN INDIVIDUAL, RECEIVER, TRUSTEE, GUARDIAN, REPRESENTATIVE, FIDUCIARY, OR REPRESENTATIVE OF ANY KIND AND REPRESENTATIVE, FIRM, ASSOCIATION, CORPORATION, OR OTHER RAMENTAL ENTITY.
5	<u>(F)</u>	"POLITICAL SUBDIVISION" MEANS:
16		(1) A COUNTY;
17		(2) THE CITY OF BALTIMORE;
18		(3) A MULTICOUNTY AGENCY;
9		(4) A MUNICIPAL CORPORATION;
20		(5) A SINGLE-PURPOSE DISTRICT; OR
21		(6) A SOIL CONSERVATION OR SANITARY DISTRICT.
22	<del>(F)</del>	"SECRETARY" MEANS THE SECRETARY OF ANY STATE AGENCY,
23	APPOINTE	D BY THE GOVERNOR.
24 25 26	OR CONDI	"STANDARD" MEANS ANY REQUIREMENT, PROHIBITION, LIMITATION, TION ESTABLISHED BY STATUTE, REGULATION, PERMIT, ORDER, OR SSUED BY A SECRETARY THE SECRETARY OR A POLITICAL SUPPLYISION IN
. /	<u> </u>	<u> </u>

28

ACCORDANCE WITH:

29

1	(1) TITLE 4, TITLE 5, SUBTITLE 9 OF THIS ARTICLE, IF THE				
2	REQUIREMENT, PROHIBITION, LIMITATION, OR CONDITION IS RELATED TO				
3	NONTIDAL WETLANDS THAT DO NOT HAVE A CONTINUOUS SURFACE CONNECTION TO				
4	SURFACE WATER; OR				
5	(2) TITLE 9, SUBTITLE 3 OR TITLE 16 OF THIS ARTICLE, IF THE				
6	REQUIREMENT, PROHIBITION, LIMITATION, OR CONDITION IS RELATED TO:				
7	(I) AN EPHEMERAL STREAM; OR				
'	(i) AN EI HEMERAL STREAM, OR				
8	(II) AN INTERMITTENT STREAM.				
9	1–902.				
1.0	(1) (1) Cryp room mo papago (2) on Evgrom ag provincia su mivio				
10	(A) (1) SUBJECT TO PARAGRAPH (2) OF EXCEPT AS PROVIDED IN THIS				
11	SUBSECTION SUBTITLE, A PERSON THAT MEETS THE THRESHOLD STANDING				
12	REQUIREMENTS UNDER FEDERAL LAW HAS STANDING IN CIVIL CLAIMS ARISING				
13	UNDER ANY STANDARD TITLE 4, TITLE 5, TITLE 9, OR TITLE 16 OF THIS ARTICLE OR				
14	TITLE 1, SUBTITLE 3, TITLE 5, SUBTITLE 16, OR TITLE 8, SUBTITLE 18 OF THE				
15	NATURAL RESOURCES ARTICLE IF THE PERSON SUFFERS AN INJURY IN FACT THAT				
16	(I) IS FAIRLY TRACEABLE TO THE CHALLENGED ACTION OF				
17	CONDUCT OF THE DEFENDANT; AND				
	,				
18	(H) Is likely to be redressed by the requested relief				
19	OR A FAVORABLE JUDICIAL DECISION.				
20	(a) An experience of the second control of t				
20	(2) AN INTEREST OR INJURY ASSERTED UNDER THIS SECTION SHALL				
21	FALL WITHIN THE ZONE OF INTERESTS SOUGHT TO BE PROTECTED BY TITLE 4				
22	TITLE 5, TITLE 9, OR TITLE 16 OF THIS ARTICLE AND TITLE 1, SUBTITLE 3, TITLE				
23	5, Subtitle 16, or Title 8, Subtitle 18 of the Natural Resources Article				
24	(B) IN ADDITION TO SUBSECTION (A) OF THIS SECTION, AN ASSOCIATION				
25	HAS STANDING IN CLAIMS ARISING UNDER TITLE 4, TITLE 5, TITLE 9, OR TITLE 16				
26	OF THIS ARTICLE OR TITLE 1, SUBTITLE 3, TITLE 5, SUBTITLE 16, OR TITLE 8				
27	SUBTITLE 18 OF THE NATURAL RESOURCES ARTICLE IF:				
-					
28	(1) ONE OR MORE MEMBERS OF THE ASSOCIATION HAVE STANDING				

30 (2) THE INTERESTS THAT THE ASSOCIATION SEEKS TO PROTECT ARE 31 GERMANE TO ITS PURPOSES; AND

**UNDER SUBSECTION (A) OF THIS SECTION;** 

- 1 NEITHER THE CLAIM ASSERTED NOR THE RELIEF REQUESTED 2 REQUIRES THE PARTICIPATION OF THE MEMBER. 3 1-903.4 SUBJECT TO SUBSECTION (B) OF THIS SECTION, A PERSON THAT HAS STANDING UNDER § 1–902 OF THIS SUBTITLE MAY BRING A CIVIL ACTION ON THE 5 PERSON'S OWN BEHALF AGAINST ANY PERSON OR GOVERNMENTAL ENTITY POLITICAL SUBDIVISION THAT IS ALLEGED TO HAVE VIOLATED OR TO BE IN VIOLATION OF ANY STANDARD. 9 (B) **(1)** SUBJECT TO PARAGRAPH (3) OF THIS SUBSECTION, AN ACTION MAY NOT BE BROUGHT UNDER SUBSECTION (A) OF THIS SECTION AT LEAST 60 DAYS 10 AFTER THE PLAINTIFF HAS GIVEN UNLESS THE PLAINTIFF FIRST GIVES 60 DAYS' 11 12 NOTICE OF THE ALLEGED VIOLATION. 13 **(2)** NOTICE UNDER THIS SUBSECTION SHALL BE: 14 (I)1. BY CERTIFIED MAIL; OR 15 2. PERSONAL SERVICE; AND 16 (II)PROVIDED TO: 1. THE APPROPRIATE SECRETARY SECRETARY; 17 18 2. THE ATTORNEY GENERAL; 3. 19 ANY LOCAL JURISDICTION IN WHICH THE ALLEGED 20 VIOLATION HAS OCCURRED IS ALLEGED TO OCCUR; AND 21 4. AN ALLEGED VIOLATOR OF THE STANDARD. 22**(3)** AN ACTION MAY NOT BE BROUGHT UNDER SUBSECTION (A) **(I)** 23OF THIS SECTION IF THE SECRETARY SECRETARY HAS COMMENCED AND IS 24DILIGENTLY PROSECUTING A CIVIL OR CRIMINAL ACTION IN A COURT OF THE STATE 25OR A CONSENT ORDER IS ENTERED TO REQUIRE COMPLIANCE FROM THE ALLEGED VIOLATOR WITHOUT UNDUE DELAY OR UNREASONABLE SCHEDULES FOR 26 27 RETURNING TO COMPLIANCE. 28 (II) NOTWITHSTANDING SUBPARAGRAPH **(I)** OF
- PARAGRAPH, A PERSON THAT HAS STANDING UNDER § 1-902 OF THIS SUBTITLE
   MEETS THE THRESHOLD STANDING REQUIREMENTS UNDER FEDERAL LAW MAY

**(2)** 

30

**GRANT:** 

$\frac{1}{2}$	INTERVENE IN $\frac{THE}{A}$ A CIVIL ACTION BROUGHT BY THE $\frac{SECRETARY}{SECRETARY}$ SECRETARY, AS PROVIDED IN § 1–904 OF THIS SUBTITLE.			
3	(4)	Noti	CE UNDER THIS SUBSECTION SHALL IDENTIFY:	
4		<b>(I)</b>	A STANDARD VIOLATED;	
5		(II)	AN ACTIVITY CONSTITUTING THE VIOLATION;	
6 7	VIOLATION;	(III)	A PERSON SUSPECTED OF BEING RESPONSIBLE FOR THE	
8		(IV)	THE LOCATION OF THE VIOLATION;	
9		<b>(</b> V <b>)</b>	THE DATES OF VIOLATIONS IF KNOWN; AND	
10		(VI)	THE NAME AND ADDRESS OF THE PERSON GIVING NOTICE.	
11 12 13 14	(C) AN ACTION BROUGHT IN ACCORDANCE WITH THIS SECTION SHALL BE BROUGHT IN ANY CIRCUIT COURT OF A COUNTY WHERE THE ALLEGED CONDITION, ACTIVITY, OR FAILURE IS OCCURRING, HAS OCCURRED, OR IS LIKELY TO OCCUR IS ALLEGED TO BE A VIOLATION OF A STANDARD.			
15 16 17 18	DEPARTMENT IS	S NOT A	HE ENTERING OF ANY CONSENT JUDGMENT TO WHICH THE A PARTY OR BEFORE THE DISMISSAL OF ANY CASE FILED IN IS SUBTITLE SUBJECT TO A SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT, THE	
19 20 21 22 23	DEPARTMENT A MAIL AT LEAST JUDGMENT OR S  (2)	SED COND THE SETTLES FILE	NOTICE AND PROVIDE A COMPLETE AND UNREDACTED COPY ONSENT JUDGMENT OR SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT TO THE CATTORNEY GENERAL BY PERSONAL SERVICE OR CERTIFIED AYS BEFORE THE DATE THAT THE PROPOSED CONSENT MENT AGREEMENT IS FILED WITH THE COURT; AND  AN AFFIDAVIT WITH THE COURT UNDER PENALTY OF	
25	·		COMPLIANCE WITH THE REQUIREMENT UNDER ITEM (1) OF	
<ul><li>26</li><li>27</li></ul>	<del></del>	OURT M		
28 29	(1) UNDER THIS SEC		ER THE ENFORCEMENT OF A STANDARD <del>CHALLENGED</del> AND	

1	(I) TEMPORARY OR PERMANENT EQUITABLE RELIEF; OR
2 3 4	(II) ANY EXCEPT AS OTHERWISE PROVIDED BY THIS SUBTITLE, ANY OTHER RELIEF PROVIDED UNDER A STATUTE CHALLENGED UNDER THIS SECTION STANDARD; AND
5 6 7	(3) IMPOSE CONDITIONS ON A DEFENDANT TO REQUIRE THE PROTECTION OF LAND, AIR, WATER, AND OTHER NATURAL RESOURCES OR PUBLIC HEALTH FROM POLLUTION, IMPAIRMENT, OR DESTRUCTION.
8 9	(E) (1) (F) IN AN ACTION UNDER THIS SECTION, THE COURT MAY AWARD THE COSTS OF LITIGATION TO:
10	(1) (1) A PREVAILING PLAINTIFF; OR
11	(H) (2) A SUBSTANTIALLY PREVAILING PLAINTIFF; OR
12 13	(3) A SUBSTANTIALLY PREVAILING DEFENDANT IF THE PLAINTIFF'S CLAIM WAS FRIVOLOUS, UNREASONABLE, OR GROUNDLESS IF THE PLAINTIFF HAS:
14 15 16	1. PARTICIPATED IN AN ACTION TO ENFORCE A VIOLATION FOLLOWING THE ISSUANCE OF NOTICE UNDER SUBSECTION (B) OF THIS SECTION; AND
17 18	2. A. Successfully established the liability of a defendant in fewer than all of the asserted claims; or
19 20 21 22	B. OTHERWISE ADVANCED THE PURPOSE OF THE RELEVANT STATUTES THROUGH THE OUTCOME OF THE ACTION BY IMPROVING ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY, PROTECTING PUBLIC HEALTH, OR REDUCING POLLUTION.
23 24 25 26	(2) If a party to an action under this section acts in bad faith or without substantial justification in maintaining or defending the action, the court may award to the adverse party the costs of litigation.
27 28 29	(F) $(G)$ $(1)$ $(I)$ $(F)$
30 31	(II) Instead of imposing a civil penalty under subparagraph (i) of this paragraph, a $\underline{A}$ court may order approve $\underline{A}$

- 1 CONSENT JUDGMENT OR SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE PARTIES THAT
- 2 INCLUDES A SUPPLEMENTAL ENVIRONMENTAL PROJECT.
- 3 (2) Subject to paragraph (3) of this subsection, a A civil
- 4 PENALTY COLLECTED UNDER THIS SUBSECTION SHALL BE DEPOSITED IN A MANNER
- 5 SPECIFIED BY THE STATUTE.
- 6 (3) If the enforcement of a statutory duty has been
- 7 DELEGATED TO A LOCAL GOVERNMENT, UP TO 50% OF A CIVIL PENALTY COLLECTED
- 8 UNDER THIS SUBSECTION MAY BE AWARDED TO THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT THE
- 9 STATE MAY NOT BE HELD LIABLE FOR CIVIL PENALTIES IN ANY ACTION UNDER THIS
- 10 SUBTITLE.
- 11 **1–904.**
- 12 (A) (1) THIS SECTION DOES NOT APPLY TO § 1-903(B)(3) OF THIS
- 13 SUBTITLE.
- 14 (B) A PERSON THAT HAS STANDING UNDER § 1–902 OF THIS SUBTITLE MAY
- 15 SUBJECT TO PARAGRAPH (2) OF THIS SUBSECTION, A PERSON THAT MEETS THE
- 16 THRESHOLD STANDING REQUIREMENTS UNDER FEDERAL LAW HAS THE
- 17 UNCONDITIONAL RIGHT AND AUTHORITY TO INTERVENE AS A MATTER OF RIGHT IN
- 18 AN A CIVIL ACTION ARISING UNDER TITLE 4, TITLE 5, TITLE 9, OR TITLE 16 OF THIS
- 19 ARTICLE OR TITLE 1, SUBTITLE 3, TITLE 5, SUBTITLE 16, OR TITLE 8, SUBTITLE 18
- 20 OF THE NATURAL RESOURCES ARTICLE, UNLESS A DEFENDANT DEMONSTRATES
- 21 THAT THE PERSON'S INTEREST IS ADEQUATELY REPRESENTED BY EXISTING
- 22 PARTIES BROUGHT BY THE SECRETARY UNDER:
- 23 (I) TITLE 5, SUBTITLE 9 OF THIS ARTICLE; OR
- 24 (II) TITLE 9, SUBTITLE 3 OF THIS ARTICLE.
- 25 (2) A PERSON SHALL EXERCISE THE RIGHT TO INTERVENE UNDER
- 26 PARAGRAPH (1) OF THIS SUBSECTION IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE APPLICABLE
- 27 PRACTICES, PROCEDURES, AND LAWS IN THE STATE.
- 28 (3) A PERSON THAT HAS STANDING TO INTERVENE UNDER
- 29 PARAGRAPH (1) OF THIS SUBSECTION HAS THE SAME RIGHTS AS AN INTERESTED
- 30 PERSON OR AGGRIEVED PARTY UNDER THE FEDERAL CLEAN WATER ACT.
- 31 (G) (B) THE STATE MAY INTERVENE AS A MATTER OF RIGHT AT ANY TIME
- 32 IN A ANY PROCEEDING BROUGHT UNDER THIS SUBTITLE.

- 1 (D) NOTWITHSTANDING § 1–903(B)(3) OF THIS SUBTITLE AND SUBSECTION
  2 (A) OF THIS SECTION, A COURT MAY GRANT INTERVENTION ON MOTION BY ANY
  3 PARTY.
- 4 <del>1-905.</del>
- THE PROVISIONS OF THIS SUBTITLE SUPERSEDE ANY INCONSISTENT
  PROVISION OF ANY STATE, COUNTY, OR MUNICIPAL LAW, ORDINANCE, OR
  REGULATION AND ANY JUDICIAL INTERPRETATION TO THE EXTENT OF THE
  INCONSISTENCY.
- 9 **[**9–344.1.
- 10 (a) Subject to subsection (b) of this section, a person who meets the threshold
  11 standing requirements under the federal Clean Water Act has an unconditional right and
  12 the authority to intervene in a civil action that the State initiates in State court to require
  13 compliance with:
- 14 <u>(1)</u> This subtitle;
- 15 (2) Regulations adopted by the Department in accordance with this 16 subtitle; or
- 17 (3) Any discharge permit, effluent limitation, or order issued by the 18 Department in accordance with this subtitle.
- 19 <u>(b)</u> A person shall exercise the right to intervene under subsection (a) of this section in accordance with the applicable practices, procedures, and laws in the State.
- 21 (c) A person who meets the requirements to intervene under subsection (a) of this 22 section has the same rights as an interested person or aggrieved party under the federal 23 Clean Water Act, including the right to apply for judicial appeal.]
- SECTION 2. AND BE IT FURTHER ENACTED, That, if any provision of this Act or the application thereof to any person or circumstance is held invalid for any reason in a court of competent jurisdiction, the invalidity does not affect other provisions or any other application of this Act that can be given effect without the invalid provision or application, and for this purpose the provisions of this Act are declared severable.
- SECTION 3. AND BE IT FURTHER ENACTED, That it is the intent of the General Assembly that this Act:
- 31 (1) provide certain remedies to abate the pollution, destruction, or 32 substantial or unreasonable impairment to the public health, water quality, or any other 33 natural resource of the State:

## **SENATE BILL 653**

)	law; and	(2)	may	not abridge or alter any right of action or remedies that exist under
:	the exercise	(3) e of the		not be construed as stopping or limiting the State or any person in to:
,			(i)	protect the natural resources of the State;
;			(ii)	suppress nuisances; or
			(iii)	abate pollution.
; )	SEC October 1,		4. ANI	D BE IT FURTHER ENACTED, That this Act shall take effect
	Approved:			
				Governor.
				President of the Senate.
				Speaker of the House of Delegates.